

**4 December 2018****FILE REF:** **SHA/19938** Tel: 0113 86 65500  
Fax: 0207 821 0029  
Email: [appeals@resolution.nhs.uk](mailto:appeals@resolution.nhs.uk)**DECISION MAKING BODY:** **NHS England (West Midlands Area Team)****GMS CONTRACTOR:** **Dr Sinha & Partners****PREMISES:** **CHURCH ROAD SURGERY,  
28 CHURCH LANE,  
ASTON,  
BIRMINGHAM,  
B6 5UP****DISPUTE RESOLUTION:** **NHS (GENERAL MEDICAL SERVICES CONTRACT)  
REGULATIONS 2015****DIRECTIONS:** **NHS (GENERAL MEDICAL SERVICES – PREMISES  
COSTS) DIRECTIONS 2013****RE:** **NOTIONAL RENT****1 Outcome**

- 1.1 For the reasons given in the report from the Advisor, I accept the recommendation on the current market rent (abated) of the subject premises with effect from 25 August 2014 which is £54,300.

**Advise / Resolve / Learn**

NHS Resolution is the operating name of NHS Litigation Authority – we were established in 1995 as a Special Health Authority and are a not-for-profit part of the NHS. Our purpose is to provide expertise to the NHS on resolving concerns fairly, share learning for improvement and preserve resources for patient care. To find out how we use personal information, please read our privacy statement at [www.nhs.uk/About-us/How-we-use-your-information---FHSAU.aspx](http://www.nhs.uk/About-us/How-we-use-your-information---FHSAU.aspx)

Accredited  
Unit 2020

**FILE REF: SHA/19938**

Tel: 0113 86 65500  
Fax: 0207 821 0029  
Email: [appeals@resolution.nhs.uk](mailto:appeals@resolution.nhs.uk)

**DECISION MAKING BODY: NHS England (West Midlands Area Team)**

**GMS CONTRACTOR: Dr Sinha & Partners**

**PREMISES: CHURCH ROAD SURGERY,  
28 CHURCH LANE,  
ASTON,  
BIRMINGHAM,  
B6 5UP**

**DISPUTE RESOLUTION: NHS (GENERAL MEDICAL SERVICES CONTRACT)  
REGULATIONS 2015**

**DIRECTIONS: NHS (GENERAL MEDICAL SERVICES – PREMISES  
COSTS) DIRECTIONS 2013**

**RE: NOTIONAL RENT**

## **1 Introduction**

- 1.1 As a GMS Provider, the above named contractor has referred the dispute of current market rent assessment as at 25 August 2014 for dispute resolution under the provision of Part 12 of the NHS (General Medical Services Contract) Regulations 2015.
- 1.2 The Secretary of State for Health and Social Care has directed that NHS Resolution exercise the functions of dispute resolution on his behalf. I, as an authorised officer of NHS Resolution, have made this determination.
- 1.3 The dispute resolution procedure also allows for advice to be sought.

## **2 The Following Points are relevant to this Application for Dispute Resolution**

- 2.1 In a letter received on 4 July 2018, the contractor through their representative, applied to NHS Resolution for Dispute Resolution. The letter stated that the contractor remained dissatisfied with the revised figure of £51,025 (abated) as reported to NHS England and sought to argue that the notional rent in respect of the contractor's surgery premises should have been assessed at a higher figure of £65,743 (abated) with effect from 25 August 2014.
- 2.2 I have had regard to the following documents made available to me in consideration of this matter:
  - 2.2.1 Letter of 4 July 2018 from GP Surveyors on behalf of the Contractor, with enclosures;

- 2.2.2 Letter of 3 August 2018 from GP Surveyors on behalf of the Contractor, with enclosures;
- 2.2.3 Letter of 3 August 2018 from NHS England, with enclosures;
- 2.2.4 Letter of 20 August 2018 from GP Surveyors on behalf of the Contractor, with enclosures
- 2.2.5 Letter of 21 August 2018 from NHS England, with enclosures;
- 2.2.6 The report from the Advisor, dated 19 November 2018.

### **3 Statutory Framework**

- 3.1 I note the GMS Contracts Regulations 2015 apply in this case. Part 12, paragraph 83 of the Regulations, indicates with some exclusions, that the NHS dispute resolution procedure applies in the case of “any dispute arising out of or in connection with the contract which is referred to the Secretary of State –
  - (a) in accordance with section 9(6) of the Act (where the agreement is an NHS contract); or
  - (b) in accordance with paragraph 82(1) (where the agreement is not an NHS contract).
- 3.2 I note Part 5 of the GMS Statement of Financial Entitlements indicates recurring premises costs such as notional rent payments are dealt with in the NHS (General Medical Services – Premises Costs (England) Directions 2004. Part 5, paragraph 42 of the Premises Costs Directions allows the PCT to make payments to the contractor, and allows for a three yearly review.
- 3.3 Where a contractor has been receiving reimbursement under the Directions since before 1 April 2013, the 2004 version of the Directions applies to each review of that reimbursement in accordance with the transitional provisions in paragraph 56(1) of the 2013 version of the Directions.
- 3.4 Representations were originally been sought on the basis of the 2013 Premises Cost Directions. Parties were advised that the 2004 Premise Cost Directions are the relevant Directions and apply in this case and were provided with the opportunity to amend their representations to reflect this. No amendments to the representations were received from either party.
- 3.5 In the absence of argument to the contrary, I will proceed on the basis that these form part of the contract and apply in this case.

### **4 Preliminary Matters**

- 4.1 In order to be able to determine the dispute properly, I decided to consult and seek advice from an Advisor appointed by the President of the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors (RICS). This Advisor uses their expert knowledge on these matters to weigh the merits of the arguments presented but, importantly, has no pecuniary or budgetary interest in the outcome.
- 4.2 The Advisor provided a report that dealt with any factual matters in dispute e.g. the floor area of the premises, and addressed the issues raised by the parties. The report is in the form of a reasoned assessment and recommendation. NHS Resolution received the report, and the parties were provided with an opportunity to make observations upon it.

## **5 Consideration**

- 5.1 I note that the District Valuer, in advice to NHS England, contended that the revised CMR as at the date fixed for review was £51,025 (after abatement). I further note that the total figure upon which the contractor seeks to rely is £65,743 (after abatement). I note that the Advisor appointed by NHS Resolution recommends the value to be £54,300 (after abatement).
- 5.2 I note that a copy of the Advisor's report was forwarded to parties for comment; I further note that neither party has provided any comments upon it.
- 5.3 A typographical error in the Report at paragraph 18 in the second set of calculations was spotted where the heading said "pre-improvement" instead of "post-improvement". This was not material to the decision but after consultation with the Advisor an amended report was provided by the Advisor.
- 5.4 For the reasons given in the report from the Advisor, I accept the recommendation on the current market rent (abated) of the subject premises with effect from 25 August 2014 which is £54,300.

### **Head of Primary Care Appeals**